

Chapter 13

Body and Mind in the Guodian Manuscripts



Lisa Raphals

This paper considers the relation between body and mind as described in the Guodian corpus. A significant body of research has already been done on moral psychology in the Guodian, and considerable scholarship on these texts investigates specifically their Confucian history (Chan 2009b, 2011, 2012; Csikszentmihalyi 2004; Pang 2000). Here I address the treatment in several Guodian texts of interrelations between body and mind, especially how they affect each other and the place of the Guodian material in the broader context of debates about mind-body dualism.

Debates about the relationship between mind and body are often described in terms of mind-body dualism and its opposite, monism or some kind of “holism.” Monist or holist views agree on the unity of mind and body, but with much debate about what kind. For example, for materialists, mental states are simply physical states; for idealists, physical states are really mental states. On dualist accounts, mind and body are both real and both different: neither can be assimilated into the other (Raphals 2015; Slingerland 2008; Yu 2007).

The question of mind-body dualism is of contemporary importance for several reasons. First, several humanistic and scientific disciplines focus on embodiment as an important dimension of the human condition, and a view of the relations between body and mind, spirit or soul is central to any understanding of the self. Second, the question of mind-body dualism is of particular interest in Chinese and comparative philosophy because of a range of claims from both Western and Chinese sources that “Chinese thought” is “holist”—including claims that there was no mind-body dualism in early China—and contrasts between ostensive Chinese holism and “Western” dualism.

One set of arguments focuses on differences between Chinese and Western understandings of heart and mind. For example, the cognitive linguist Ning Yu has

L. Raphals (✉)
University of California, Riverside, CA, USA
e-mail: raphals@ucr.edu

argued that Chinese cultural conceptualizations of the heart or mind differ fundamentally from Western dualism: the heart is understood as the central faculty of both affective and cognitive activity and the source of thought, feelings, emotions and guiding behaviour. Yu argues that this cultural conceptualization differs in fundamental ways from the dualism of modern Western philosophy, which asserts a dichotomy between reason and emotion, in which thoughts and ideas are linked to a largely disembodied “mind”, and desires and emotions with an embodied “heart” (Yu 2007: 27–28).

Three important themes concerning body and mind recur in the Guodian manuscripts overall. First are accounts of the constituents of both humans and animals, specifically discussions of the nature of the body or physical person, basic emotions (*qing* 情), and the mind.¹ Second is a discussion of the nature of specifically human mental qualities, especially the heartmind (*xin* 心), spirit (*shen* 神) and intentions or will (*zhi* 志). *Shen* is discussed in *Taiyi shengshui* 太一生水 (The Great One Gives Birth to Water). A related and third important theme that recurs throughout the Guodian texts is accounts of mutual relations between mind and body: both how the body, and with it the emotions, affect the mind and how the heartmind directs or rules the body. Discussions of how the body affects the mind appear in *Zun deyi* 尊德義 (Honouring Virtue and Propriety, henceforward ZDY) and more extensively in *Xing zi ming chu* 性自命出 (Human Nature Comes from the Mandate, henceforward XZMC), which contains an extensive discussion of how the body and emotions affect the heartmind. Accounts of how the heartmind rules the body appear in *Ziyi* 緇衣 (Black Robes, henceforward ZY) and more extensively in *Wuxing* 五行 (Five Kinds of Action, henceforward WX). Additional relevant passages occur in *Qiong da yi shi* 窮達以時 (Poverty or Success is a Matter of Timing, henceforward QD), *Tang Yu zhi dao* 唐虞之道 (The Way of Tang and Yu, henceforward TYD), *Cheng zhi* 成之 (Bringing Things to Completion, henceforward CZ), *Liu de* 六德 (Six Virtues, henceforward LD) and four texts titled *Yucong* 語叢 1–4 (Thicket of Sayings, henceforward YC).² The XZMC, WX (discussed below) and other Guodian texts have equivalents in texts excavated from other Warring States and Han tombs, but these are beyond the scope of the present discussion.³

¹ Due to an extensive debate about the meaning of the term *qing* 情, I transliterate rather than translate this term throughout (e.g., Puett 2004; Middendorf 2008).

² Chinese quotations of the Guodian are from *Guodian Chumu zhujian* (henceforward *Guodian Chumu*) and Liu Zhao (Jingmenshi Bowuguan 1998; Liu 2003). Guodian slips are cited for both the entire corpus and specific text. For example, a passage in Guodian slip 483, YC 1, slip 45 would be cited as 483/YC1 45. For simplicity of transcription I have used the editors' emendations. For example, 凡又(有)血氣者 is simply transcribed as 凡有血氣者. Translations of the Guodian manuscripts are my own but are indebted to Cook's (2012) readings of the text, survey of the key scholarship and translations.

³ The Shanghai Museum texts include a version of the XZMC titled “Discussion of *Qing* and *Xing*” (*Xingqing lun* 性情論) (Ma 2001; Ji 2004). Another version of the *Wuxing* was excavated from Mawangdui (Mawangdui Hanmu boshu zhengli xiaozu 1980: 17–27; Csikszentmihalyi 2004: 312–71).

I argue that we find a scale of views on the relation between mind and body in the Guodian texts. The XZMC in particular presents what could be called a weak mind-body dualism, in apparent differences between the body's passive response to sensation and emotion, and the capacity of the mind to use active agency to control those responses, especially through thinking or reflection (*si* 思).

At one end of the scale is a strong mind-body dualism in several passages in WX and ZY. These texts present metaphors that compare the heartmind to the ruler of a state, and the body or the senses to its ministers or officials, or to slaves. At the other end of the spectrum is a robustly holist view of *qi* 氣 as unifying body and mind. Here, similarities between the “flow” of *qi*, sound, and music are the conduits that make possible moral transformation through music.

The first section takes up several passages from the Guodian manuscripts that describe relations between body, mind and emotions as constituents of both humans and animals. These passages make it clear that animals, as well as human beings, have *qi*, *qing* and intentions. However, the potential ability of the heartmind to interact with *qing* and intentions seems to be unique to humans. For humans, our essential nature (*xing* 性) affects fundamental emotions (*qing*), which in turn move the heartmind. The next section takes up Guodian accounts of the constitution of a (human) person, including body or physical person and its relationship to the heartmind, virtue and self-cultivation. The third section takes up an extensive discussion of the relation between body and mind in the XZMC and WX. Section four turns to the strong dualism of ruler-ruled metaphors in the WX and ZY. Section five examines a strongly holist view of sound and music in the XZMC and elsewhere.

1 Body, Emotion and Heartmind in Humans and Animals

Several passages from the Guodian manuscripts describe relations between body, mind and emotions as constituents of both humans and animals. A passage from the YC (Thicket of Sayings) describes the constitution of humans and animals thus:

凡有血氣者，皆有喜有怒，有慎有莊；其體有容有色，有聲有嗅有味，有氣有志。物有本有卯，⁴有終有始。

In general, all things that have blood and *qi* have happiness and anger, caution and gravity. Their bodies have appearance and colour, they have sounds, smells and flavours, they have *qi* and intentions. In all cases living things have roots and branches; they have ends and beginnings. (483–87/YC1 45–49)

The important reference to “all things that have blood and *qi*” (*you xue qi zhe* 有血氣者) makes it clear that the passage is not limiting itself to human beings, since “being composed of blood and *qi*” is common to humans and other animals (Raphals 2018; Sterckx 2007). The passage also makes it clear that, in addition to shared

⁴After Li Tianhong's and Scott Cook's reading of 𣎵 as root (*ben* 本) and 卯 as branches (*biao* 標) (Li 2003; Cook 2012: 814–15).

physical constitution, humans share three things with other animals. The first is fundamental emotions and desires: the basic emotions of joy and anger and the basic responses to desire of satisfaction (when desires are satisfied) and suffering (when they are not). Second, we share with animals the four sensory modalities of sight, hearing, smell and taste. Finally, both humans and animals have *qi* and intentions (*zhi*).

Although the above passages make clear that emotions and desires are common to “all things that have blood and *qi*,” a passage in the XZMC suggests that a complex relation to the heartmind seems unique to humans:

道四術，唯人道為可道也。其三術者，道之而已。詩、書、禮、樂，其始出皆生於人。

Dao has four arts, but only the human *dao* is worthy to take; as for the [other] three arts, if you take them, that is all. The beginning and emergence of the *Odes*, *Documents*, *Ritual*, and *Music* all were from the human. (336–38/XZMC 14–16)

This point is explicit in a second YC 1 passage that identifies the intentions with the heart or heartmind, presumably only in humans:

容色，目也。聲，耳也。嗅，鼻也。味，口也。氣，容也。志，心也。

Appearance and colour are [a matter of] the eyes, sound the ears, smell the nose, flavour the mouth. *Qi* is [a matter of] appearance, intentions of the heartmind. (488–90/XZMC 45–48)

It is important to note that this passage does not specifically refer to humans, insofar as animals also have intentions. However the reference to appearance or demeanour (*rong* 容) probably does make it clear that the passage is intended to describe humans, though the notion that animals can have demeanour will be instantly familiar to anyone who has ever had a cat.

A third passage from YC 3 emphasizes the specific importance of the heartmind:

嵩志，益。在心，益。

To raise oneself by intentions is advantageous. To care for one’s heartmind is advantageous (619/YC3 15).

Taken together, these passages suggest that it is the heartmind that can take charge of the perceptions, emotions and desires common to all animals, and to cultivate it is beneficial.

2 The Human Constitution

Several Guodian texts give passing accounts of the body or physical person (*shen* 身) and its relationship to the heartmind, virtue and self-cultivation.

A problem arises because body and mind are not neutral terms. They are culturally constructed, and are also subject to changes of meaning over time. An example is changing meanings of the interrelated English terms mind, spirit, soul, and heart

(Wierzbicka 1989). Classical Chinese has no near equivalents for terms such as “body,” “mind” and “soul.” Three major terms for “body” differ from the English notion in important ways. *Xing* 形 refers to form or shape of bodies but also of other things. *Shen* 身 refers to a body, person, “physical person” or personality. *Ti* 體 refers to the concrete physical body, including limbs and physical form, but also to the “embodiment” of other things, including spiritual, cosmic, and moral states (Lo 2003).

Several terms describe mind or soul. The seat of consciousness and thought is the heartmind (*xin*), which refers both to the mind and to the physical organ of the heart, and “spirit” (*shen* 神), which can also refer to gods and spirits, sages, ancestors, ghosts and monsters (Sterckx 2007). Other key terms are will or intentions (*zhi* 志), awareness, knowledge or consciousness (*zhi* 智), desires (*yu* 欲), thought or awareness (*yi* 意), and thinking or reflection (*si* 思).

Passages in several Guodian texts underscore the importance of the body. ZY makes it clear that a “person” is in some fundamental sense material and physical when it states that in antiquity the Lord in Heaven observed King Wen’s virtue and concentrated the great mandate upon his person (*qi ji da ming yu jue shen* 其集大命于厥身, 121–22/ZY 36–37). According to *Taiyi shengshui*, those who use *dao* to carry things are successful in their tasks and long-lived in their persons (*shi cheng er shen chang* 事成而身長); and in the case of sages, their achievements are successful and their persons not injured (*gong cheng er shen bu shang* 功成而身不傷, 82–83/*Taiyi shengshui* 11–12). Another passage in ZDY describes how the body affects the mind, and the porosity of the two. According to this text, ritual and music “nurture the heartmind (*yang xin* 養心) in compassion and integrity, so that faithfulness and trust increase daily without any self-awareness” (*zi zhi* 自知, 304/ZDY 21).

That a “person” is both physical and psychological is made clear in a discussion of the virtue of benevolence (*ren* 仁). TYD 唐虞之道 concludes with the observation that “when one insists on rectifying one’s person/self (*zheng qi shen* 正其身) before rectifying the world, the *dao* of sages is complete” (207–08/TYD 2–3). Used purely of a physical person, this passage could refer to straightening one’s body, but that is clearly not the meaning here. Similarly, another passage from CZ describes the governance and instruction of a noble man who, before undertaking oversight of the people, first “submits his [physical] person to goodness” (*shen fu shan* 身服善, 246/CZ 3). The passage continues that if he “lacks it in his person” (*wang hu qi shen* 亡乎其身) and merely preserves it in words, the people will not follow him, no matter how much he piles up commands (245–46/CZ 4–5). This discussion opposed the use of punishments and penalties to government by virtue, and specifically by those who *embody* virtue in their persons.

The term *ti* is also applied to the bodies—and powers—of animals. For example, QD includes an argument that excellence—moral or physical—does not necessarily result in recognition. Thus the meritorious Wu Zixu (d. 484 BCE) was executed, but not because his wisdom had declined. The passage concludes with the bodies of two famous horses: “That Ji was hobbled at Mount Zhang and Jin was trapped in the Qiu

wilds was not because they had declined in the strength of their bodies” (*ti zhuang*, 149–50/QD 9–10).⁵

Several passages discuss the will or intentions, usually of a noble man or *junzi* 君子 (this term is transliterated throughout). For example, *ZY* attributes a saying to Confucius that a *junzi* “cannot be robbed of his intentions in life and cannot be robbed of his good name in death” (123/*ZY* 38). A passage in *WX* explicitly links intentions with correct mental attitudes:

士有志於君子道謂之志士。

A scholar [*shi*] whose intentions are on the *dao* of a *junzi* can be called a scholar of intentions. (162/*WX* 7).

The passage continues by linking intentions to wisdom:

德弗志不成，智弗思不得。

Virtue without intention will not be realized; wisdom without reflection will not get it. (162–63/*WX* 7–8).

Another passage from *LD* suggests that intentions transcend individual will and the individual person who “hides his own will and seeks to nourish the intentions of his family” (逸其志，求養親之志 422/*LD* 33).

Spirit (*shen* 神) is a central term in *Taiyi shengshui* 太一生水. Here, spirit brilliance (*shen ming* 神明) is formed from the consecutive joinings of The Great One (*Taiyi* 太一), Heaven and Earth. Spirit brilliance in turn forms *yin* and *yang*, which in turn form the four seasons (73/*Taiyi shengshui* 2). Thus:

陰陽者，神明之所生也。神明者，天地之所生也。天地者，太一之所生也。

Yin and *yang* are that which is born of spirit brilliance; spirit brilliance is that which is born of Heaven and Earth; Heaven and Earth are that which is born of the Great One. (76–77/*Taiyi shengshui* 5–6)

Here, *shen* precedes even the creation of *yin* and *yang*. In other late Warring States texts it is also a major component of a person, especially in the *Huangdi neijing* 黃帝內經, where it is stored in the heart.

心藏神，肺藏魄，肝藏魂，脾藏意，腎藏志。

The heart stores spirit [*shen*]; the lungs store *po*; the liver stores *hun*; the spleen stores thought [*yi*]; the kidneys store will [*zhi*].⁶

In the *Guodian* texts overall, *shen* is not a major element in relations between mind and body.

⁵ 驥馱張山驪空於卻空，非亡體壯也。Textual problems surround the names and provenance of these famous horses, but the context is clearly a comparison between their inherent strength and being subdued.

⁶ *Huangdi neijing suwen* 23, 153 (*Xuanming wu qi* 宣明五氣), trans. after Unschuld and Tessenow 2011: 1:409. For the importance of form/body (*xing*) and spirit (*shen*) in the *Huangdi neijing* see Wong (2014: 25–29). For body and mind in the *Guodian* manuscripts see Guo (2000).

3 Heartmind and Body in the *Xing zi ming chu*

I now turn to how the body motivates the heartmind and how the heartmind rules the body. The XZMC is significant for any discussion of mind and body because it provides a detailed discussion of the relationship between human nature and self-cultivation. In this context it discusses and links several key concepts, including essential nature (*xing* 性), genuine emotions (*qing* 情), heartmind (*xin* 心), will, intentions (*zhi* 志), *qi* 氣, and the use of artifice (*qiao* 巧, *wei* 偽).

The XZMC includes both accounts of human motivation as a passive response to external forces and the active role of the heartmind in shaping responses to the world by forming stable intention that overrides the influence of external forces and emotional responses to them (Perkins 2009).

3.1 A “Body Moves Mind” Model of Human Motivation

The XZMC begins with a statement about clearly human (and not animal) nature and the importance of both environment and habit:

凡人雖有性，心亡莫志，待物而後作，待悅而後行，待習而後定。喜怒哀悲之氣，性也。及其見於外，則物取之也。性自命出，命自天降。

In general people, although they have a nature, their heartminds do not have fixed intentions. They await things and only then act; they await pleasure and only then go; they await habit and only then stabilize. The *qi* of happiness, anger, grief, and sorrow is by nature. When it [the *qi*] arises and is visible externally, things take hold of it. Nature emerges from the mandate; the mandate descends from Heaven. (323–25/XZMC 1–3)

Here, fixed intentions emerge only when they are taken in hand, because it is the nature of the intentions of the heartmind (*xin zhi zhi* 心之志) to only act when induced. In other words, on this account, the heartmind is passive. But the passage continues:

道始於情，情生於性。始者近情，終者近義。知【情者能】出之，知義者能納之。好惡，性也。所好所惡，物也。善不【善，性也】所善所不善，勢也。

Dao begins in *qing*; *qing* is born from nature [*xing*]. Its beginning is close to *qing* but its ends are close to propriety. Those who understand [*qing* are able] to make it emerge; those who understand propriety are able to incorporate it. Liking and disliking are matters of nature; what is liked or disliked are matters of things. Approval and disapproval are matters of nature; what is approved and not approved are matters of situational power. (324–26/XZMC 3–5)

This passage indicates two ways in which mental dispositions potentially influence the body. First, *dao* is closely linked to basic emotions, which may be subject to intervention or control. Second, although what we like and dislike may be a matter of external objects (things), perceived through sensation, what we chose to approve and disapprove are matters of choice through situational power and advantage (*shi* 勢). The passage continues:

凡性為主，物取之也。金石之有聲，□□□□□□ 雖有性心，弗取不出。凡心有志也，亡與不□□□□□獨行，猶口之不可獨言也。

In general, human nature acts as lord, and things take hold of it. The sounds of bronze [bells] and stone [chimes] □□□□□□ [emerge only when they are struck.] Although [humans] have natures and heartminds, if nothing takes hold [of them] they do not emerge. In general, heartminds have intentions, but they forget them and do not □□□□□□ [That the heartmind cannot] act alone is like the mouth alone being unable to speak. (327–29/XZMC 5–7)

This partially fragmentary passage clearly describes a heartmind that requires external stimulation through the body. The passage continues that people have a common nature (*qi xing yi* 其性一) but differ in how they use (*yong* 用) their heartminds:

四海之內其性一也。其用心各異，教使然也。凡性或動之，或逆⁷之，或交之，或厲之，或出之，或養之，或長之。凡動性者，物也；逢/逆性者，悅也；交性者，故也；厲性者，義也；出性者，勢也；養性者，習也；長性者，道也。

Within the four seas their nature is one. But in their use of the heartmind each is different, and this is due to the direction of their education. As for inner nature in general, some things move it, some go against it, some restrain it, some sharpen it, some make it emerge, some nourish it, some grow it. In general, what causes inner nature to move is things; what goes against it is pleasure; what restrains it is causes/precedents; what sharpens it is rightness; what makes it emerge is situational power; what nourishes it is practice; what grows it is *dao* (331–34/XZMC 9–12).

In this scale, sages (*sheng ren* 聖人) have a key role because of their ability to literally embody correct values:

聖人比其類而論會之，觀其先後而訓之，體其義而節文之。

The sages compared their categories and arranged and assembled them; observed their precedence and deference and put them in conformity, embodied their propriety [*ti qi yi*] and gave it regularity and pattern. (338–39/XZMC 16–17)

Franklin Perkins describes this as a simple stimulus-response model of human psychology and motivation, but a somewhat different approach is to examine relations between body and mind, especially the XZMC's emphasis on sensation as the “stimulus” by which the body influences the heartmind (Perkins 2009: 119).

3.2 The Heartmind Takes Charge

The passages discussed above suggest an outer-inner porosity in which, without fixed nature or intentions, the complex of the body, sensations and emotions all move the heartmind, with no account of any agency in choosing how to respond to sensory and emotional stimuli. But other passages in the XZMC suggest the existence of a more authentic heartmind that is not at the mercy of these patterns.

⁷Reading 違 as *ni* 逆 (oppose), after Huang and Xu, Li Ling and others (Huang and Xu 1999; Li 2002). *Guodian Chumu* glosses it as 逢 (?). For further discussion see Cook 2012: 705n61.

One passage recommends the use of the heartmind in thinking (*si zhi yong xin* 思之用心) as an alternative to the heartmind being buffeted constantly by the inputs of the body and emotions, but even here its relation to thought is complex:

凡憂思而後悲，凡樂思而後忻。凡思之用心為甚。難，思之方也。其聲變，【則其心變】，其心變則其聲亦然。⁸

In general, it is only after thinking that worry becomes sorrow; in general, it is only after thinking that happiness becomes delight. In general, the use of the heartmind in thinking is deep. The difficulty is in the directions of thinking. When the sound changes [then the heartmind changes], when the heartmind changes then the sound also changes. (353–55/XZMC 31–33)

Here, dwelling on emotions intensifies them. The passage also presents something of a “chicken and egg” problem in that emotions (described in terms of sound, either music or the human voice) affect the heartmind, which affects them in return.

Other passages underscore the importance of the activity of the heartmind:

凡道，心術為主。

As for *dao* in general, the techniques of the heartmind rule. (336/XZMC 14).

凡學者求其心為難，從其所為，近得之矣，不如以樂之速也。⁹

As for learning in general, seeking the [genuine] heartmind is difficult. It is by following that which is done that one comes close to getting it, it is not like using the speed [immediacy] of music. (358/XZMC 36)

This passage clearly recommends a heartmind that, although difficult to access and less directly available than the influence of music, is more genuine and thus preferable. It draws on earlier accounts of the potential of music to elevate or degenerate the moral faculties, but does not pursue the issue at length. The passage continues:

雖能其事，不能其心，不貴。求其心有偽也，弗得之矣。人之不能以偽也，可知也。

Although you may be able to [accomplish] an undertaking, if you cannot [attain] the heartmind, it is not valuable. If in searching for the heartmind there is artifice, you will not attain it. [Thus] that people cannot [attain it] by using artifice is [something] we can know. (359–60/XZMC 37–38)¹⁰

How then, according to the XZMC, is this difficult state to be attained? One passage gives a clearly negative recommendation: that artifice (*wei* 偽) is incompatible with the genuine heartmind.¹¹

⁸ Using the *Guodian Chumu* reading of *nan* 難. For other readings see Cook 2012: 723n211.

⁹ For 求 or 求 see Qiu 1998: 183n35.

¹⁰ Clear consensus reads 為 as *wei* 偽 (artifice). Slip 38 is broken after 可知也 and scholars disagree about what to interpolate. In reading *bu*, I follow Liu 2003: 90, 100; Cook 2012: 727–28nn241–44). Qiu interpolates *qi* 其 (if one commits the transgression ten times) (Qiu 1998: 183n39).

¹¹ The remainder of slip 360 contains several textual problems, but seems to indicate that, with no more than ten tries, the heartmind must lie therein (*qi xin bi zai yan* 其心必在焉), and its manifestations can be examined.

The passage continues by contrasting different components of a person on which one might rely in a descending scale that gives preference to the heartmind:

凡用心之躁者，思為甚。用智之疾者，患為甚。用情之至者，哀樂為甚。用身之弁者，悅為甚。用力之盡者，利為甚。目之好色，耳之樂聲，鬱陶氣也，人不難為之死。¹²

In general, for those who use the agitation of the heartmind, their thinking is deep. For those who use the speed of knowledge, their anxiety is deep. For those who use the extremity of their *qing*, their grief and happiness are deep. Of those who use the agitation of their physical persons, their satisfaction is deep. Of those who use the limit of their force, their benefit is deep. The eyes' love of colour and the ears' love of sound create unassuaged joy or anxiety [*yutao*]. It is not difficult for people to die of this. (364–66/XZMC 42–44)

The passage contrasts those who rely on thinking and knowledge with those who rely on emotion and the sensations and physical force of the body. There may be short-term satisfactions to the latter, but the consequences can be fatal.

So far, the argument seems to be that careful use of the heartmind and thinking can circumvent the dangers posed by the body and emotions. But self-regulation by means of the heartmind is not sufficient because even correct conduct—faced with distracting sensations and emotions—can still degenerate into ostentation or dissolute or degenerate behaviour if the heartmind does not have the right dispositions (366–69/XZMC 44–47). But how is it to get them?

The XZMC ends with a description of how a *junzi* can take charge of intentions (*zhi zhi* 執志). It starts by stressing the need for genuineness and the destructiveness of cunning and artifice:

進欲遜而毋巧，退欲肅而毋輕，欲皆文而毋偽。君子執志必有夫往往之心，出言必有夫東東[簡簡]之信。¹³

In advancing one should be modest and not cunning; in withdrawing one should be sombre and not frivolous. In all cases one should be finely patterned but not artificial. The *junzi* in taking charge of his intentions must have a broad-minded heartmind; in speaking words he must have a straightforward trustworthiness. (386–388/XZMC 64–66)

The passage continues that he must display an appropriate appearance in guest ritual, a respectful appearance in sacrificial ritual, and he must have a grief-stricken appearance in mourning rituals (388–89/66–67).

The passage ends with a perplexing sentence, which does not occur in the Shanghai Museum version and which scholars construe in two entirely different ways. It reads:

君子身以為主心

- (1) *Junzi* use their bodies to master their heartminds
- (2) *Junzi* know their bodies are ruled by the heartmind. (389/XZMC 67)

¹² Qiu reads *bian* 弁 as *bian* 變 (erratic) (Qiu 1998: 183n42). CHEN Wei reads *ji* 急 (agitated) (Chen 2002: 204). For discussion of other readings of *yutao* 鬱陶 see Cook 2012: 732n287.

¹³ In reading *su* 肅 (solemn, sombre) I follow Li 2002: 108 and Cook 2012: 2:748. *Guodian Chumu* and Liu Zhao do not transcribe the graph 肅 (Jingmenshi Bowuguan 1998; Liu 2003: 106). For readings of *wang* 往 and *jian* 東[簡] see Cook (2012: 748nn402, 403).

At issue is whether the heartmind rules, guides or expresses itself through body, or whether the body shapes, forms or rules the heartmind. As written, the obvious construction of the sentence is (1), in which the phrase is read straightforwardly to mean “*Junzi* use their bodies to master their heartminds” and the body is clearly doing the ruling. LIU Xinlan and PANG Pu opt for the body as ruler. According to LIU Xinlan the phrase refers to the attention of *junzis* to their own conduct to correct the heartmind (LIU Xinlan 2000: 354–55). According to PANG Pu, “The gentleman uses his self to master his heart” (Pang 2000: 53). LI Tianhong agrees with their readings and suggests that *zhu* 主 has the sense of “to preserve” or “to maintain” (Li 2003: 197). Chan takes it as “it is the body that he uses to master the heart” (Chan 2009a: 379n44). Perkins suggests “use their bodies to master their hearts” (Perkins 2009: 118–19, 128).¹⁴

Other scholars take the meaning to be (2), that the heartmind rules the body. This meaning requires some kind of emendation and several have been proposed. LIU Zhao thinks the phrase should read “for the *junzi* the body takes the heartmind as master” (*junzi shen yi xin wei zhu* 君子身以心為主) (LIU Zhao 2000: 89). In a later publication he translates it as: “The body of a *junzi* realizes/embodies the heart” (Liu 2003: 106). CHEN Wei takes *wei* as “for the sake of” and *zhu* as “to maintain” and gets “the body is used to master the heart” (Chen 2002: 201). GUO Yi interpolates *yu* 於 between “ruler” (*zhu*) and “heart” (*xin*) to get *junzi shen yi wei zhu yu xin* 君子身以為主於心; here too the *junzi* takes the body to be under the control of the heart (Guo 2001: 264). LIAO Mingchun takes the phrase to mean “using the body to express/reflect [*zhu*] the heart” (*yi shen wei zhu xin* 以身為主心), with *zhu* understood as “to express” or “to reflect,” with the meaning “the *junzi* takes the body as an expression of the heart” (Liao 2001: 168–69).

3.3 Heartmind and Body in the Wuxing

Wuxing presents a different set of claims for porosity between body and mind, where the heartmind affects the body. A full account of that text is beyond the scope of the present discussion, but a few passages warrant mention.¹⁵ The context in the WX is a discussion of whether “five kinds of action” take shape from within (*nei* 內) or without (*wai* 外). The five are the five virtues of benevolence (*ren*), propriety (*yi* 義), ritual propriety (*li* 禮), wisdom (*zhi* 智) and sagacity (*sheng* 聖). Those that take place from within are described as “virtuous action” (*de zhi xing* 德之行); those that arise from without are simply “action” (*xing* 行, 156–58/WX 1–3).

¹⁴For a summary of these views see Li 2003: 196–97. Other advocates of (1) include LIU Xinlan, who reads the passage in the sense that the solemnity of one’s external deportment (*shen*) serves to mould the heartmind (LIU Xinlan 2000). Other advocates of (2) include DING Yuanzhi and ZHAO Jianwei (Ding Yuanzhi 2000: 119; Zhao 1999). For further discussion of this passage see Perkins 2009; Cook 2012: 749–50n408.

¹⁵The following WX translations are indebted to Csikszentmihalyi (2004: Appendix 2: 277–310).

It is in this context that WX discusses several states of the “inner heartmind” (*zhong xin* 中心):

君子亡中心之憂則亡中心之智，亡中心之智則亡中心【之悅】，亡中心【之悅則不】安，不安則不樂，不樂則亡德。

If the *junzi* lacks the anxiety of the inner heartmind (*zhongxin zhi you*), he will also lack the wisdom of the inner heartmind (*zhong xin zhi zhi*). If he lacks the wisdom of the inner heartmind, he will lack the [joy of the] inner heartmind. If he lacks [the joy of] the inner heartmind [then he will not] be at peace; if he is not at peace then he will not be happy; if he is not happy then he will lack virtue. (160–61/WX 5–6)

The five conducts are also closely linked to reflection or contemplation (*si* 思). To be essential, contemplation requires the virtue of benevolence; to be extensive, it requires wisdom; to be effortless, it requires sagacity.¹⁶ The WX also links different dispositions of the inner heartmind (*nei xin*) with different outward dispositions. To use one’s inner heartmind in relating to others (*yi qi zhong xin yu ren jiao* 以其中心與人交) is joy. Transferring the joy of the inner heartmind to brothers results in closeness, which in turn extends to producing the feeling of kinship or familiarity (*qin* 親). Kinship in turn extends to love (*ai* 愛), and love for fathers and then for others produces benevolence (*ren*). The passage concludes:

■中心辯然而正行之，直也。

To make discriminations in the inner heartmind and then to orient it correctly in conduct is to be straightforward. (187–89/WX 32–34)

In summary, we find in both the XZMC and the WX not only an account of how the heartmind is motivated by sensation and emotion, but also an account of how the heartmind can use reflection to form stable intentions. Several scholars have stressed the importance and agency of the heartmind. JIANG Guanghui describes this agency as free will (Jiang Guanghui 2000: 34). DING Sixin argues that it transcends the body (*chaoyue shenti* 超越身体) (DING Sixin 2000: 303–04).¹⁷ Perkins usefully characterizes them as concerned with avoiding what the Greeks called *akrasia*: weakness of the will (Perkins 2009: 130). For purposes of the present discussion, the important point is that there is a strong degree of interaction between the body and heartmind that resists classification as strongly dualist or strongly holist.

4 Mind-Body Dualism: The Heartmind as Ruler

Two Guodian texts present a strongly dualist political analogy in which the heartmind rules the body as a ruler rules a state:

¹⁶不仁，思不能清。不智，思不能長... 【不】仁，思不能清。不聖，思不能輕。(164 and 166/WX 9 and 11).

¹⁷For other accounts see Andreini 2006: 162, and Perkins 2009: 127–28.

耳目鼻口手足六者，心之役也。心曰唯，莫敢不唯；諾，莫敢不諾；進，莫敢不進；後，莫敢不後。

The ears, eyes, nose, mouth, hands, and feet—these six are the slaves of the heartmind. When the heartmind says “acquiesce,” none dares not acquiesce; [when it says] “promise,” none dares not promise; [when it says] “advance,” none dares not advance; [when it says] “go back,” none dares not go back. (200–01/WX 45–46)

For the important term “slaves” (literally corvee labour) I follow the gloss of LIU Zhao, which also accords with the Mawangdui version of this text.¹⁸

A similar passage occurs in ZY:

■子曰：民以君為心，君以民為體，心好則體安之，君好則民欲之。故心以體廢，君以民亡。

The Master said: The people take the ruler as their heartmind; the ruler takes the people as his body. When the heartmind is fond of something the body is at peace with it; when the ruler is fond of something the people desire it. Therefore the heartmind [may] be maimed by the body and the ruler [may] be destroyed by the people. (93–94/ZY 8–9)

Dualism is expressed in the clear qualitative difference between the ruler and his ministers or people.

5 Mind-Body Holism: *Qi*, Sound and Music

The XZMC also supports a strongly holist view of mind and body. As Pham has argued, the XZMC asserts that *qi*, sound and music all share a quality of “flowing and fulfilling” (*chongying liudong de tezhi* 充盈流動的特質) (Pham 2013: 54). This shared quality is what makes it possible for music to guide *qi* in passing through both body and mind in ways that ultimately further moral self-cultivation. According to Pham, the YC1 account of the common emotional endowment of humans and animals (YC1 45–49, discussed above) constructs a “body-mind-*qi* mode of discourse” (*shen xin qi de lunshu moshi* 身心氣的論述模式) which is common to the shared outlook of the Guodian texts. On this view, it is the very permeability between mind and body, expressed in the flow of *qi*, that makes it possible for music to be so fundamental to self-cultivation (Pham 2013: 62).

I present the logic of this argument as follows: (1) claims for the importance of stimulation via sensations and basic emotions, as a basic feature of human nature; (2) the special suitability of music to stimulate the emotions via sensation; (3) the ability of thought or reflection and other activities of the heartmind to produce emo-

¹⁸LIU Zhao reads the graph 逵 as *yi* 役 (Liu 2003: 85–86). ZHANG Jing takes the graph as a form of 迓, glossed as *tuo* 託 in the sense of “delegates” or “subordinates” (Zhang 2004). By contrast, YUAN Guohua reads it as 遯, understood as limited or curtailed by the heartmind (Yuan 2000). Cook also takes the graph as a variant of *yi*. For summary of this discussion see Cook (2012: 516–17n204).

tions and other affective states; and (4) the common grounding of body, *qing* and heartmind in *qi*.¹⁹

The argument begins with a set of claims for the importance of stimulation due to the setup of human nature. Humans' heartminds only develop intentions when stimulated in a positive way (*yue* 悅). Such stimulation leads to goal-directed action. These motivating stimuli include basic emotions (*qing*), which are described as constellations of *qi* (323–24/XZMC 1–2, quoted above). The XZMC compares human nature (*xing*) to “a vibrating system” in which resonance can occur as in musical instruments, which only emit sound when struck (Middendorf 2008: 146). So in order to stimulate *qi* to provoke emotional response, things in the external world must “grab” attention and thereby stimulate response and action (327–28/XZMC 5–6). Unlike other animals, humans need to learn (*xue*) in order for their heartminds to acquire a specific direction (327–30/XZMC 5–8). This is done by “using the heartmind” (331/XZMC 9).

5.1 *Emotion, Agency and Music*

In the XZMC, an important effect of sensation is the ability of sound—specifically music—to stimulate the basic emotions, which in turn move the heartmind. But is the original stimulus from sound or from emotions behind them? This passage seems to ground the original stimulus in the emotions that produce music:

凡聲，其出於情也信，然後其入拔人之心也厚。

As for sounds in general, when the ones that emerge from the *qing* are trustworthy, and then enter and capture the human heartmind, it is profound. (345/XZMC 23)

The XZMC stresses the importance of music in educating the heartmind because music (both ancient and contemporary) affects the heartmind quickly and directly:

凡古樂龍心，益樂龍指，皆教其人者也。

In general, ancient music stirs [lit., “makes a dragon of”] the heartmind; extravagant music stirs the desires [*long zhi*]; both are things that can instruct the people. (350/XZMC 28)

The passage continues that both extreme music (*yue* 樂) or happiness (*le* 樂, the same graph has both meanings) and extreme mourning or grief (*bei* 悲) bring out the utmost of their affections:

其性相近也，是故其心不遠。

Their natures are similar, therefore their heartminds are not far apart. (351–52/XZMC 29–30)

Middendorf makes four points about the influence of sound and music on *qing* (Middendorf 2008: 147–48). First, the XZMC considers “sound to be trustworthy” (*xin* 信), whether in the form of laughter, the singing voice, the sound of musical

¹⁹The first three steps of this analysis are indebted to Middendorf 2008.

instruments, or its symbiosis with vision in dance. It is this trustworthiness that makes sound able to influence its listeners so profoundly (335–48/XZMC 23–26). Second, music has a specific ability to change people’s affective states and to teach moral (or immoral) values (348–50/XZMC 26–28). Third is the claim that strong emotions—grief (*ai*, *bei*) and joy (*le*) especially—tend to be followed by their opposites (351/XZMC 29). Fourth, thinking or reflection (*si*) also influences the quality of emotions; anxious thoughts lead to sadness, joyous thoughts to delight (354–55/XZMC 32–33). Musical education is especially facilitated by a “seeking of the heartmind” (*qiu qi xin* 求其心, slip 358/XZMC 36), aided by the “trustworthiness” of sound and the correct “orientation of *qing*” (*qing zhi fang* 情之方, 362/XZMC 40).

5.2 The Body Mind Qi Loop

The analysis to this point gives no explanation for interactions between body and mind beyond the specific case of the trustworthiness of sound. I now turn to a more systematically holist account of body and heartmind in the XZMC based on the nature of *qi* in constituting both. As Pham puts it, “the body’s colouration and appearance is the container of the activity of the heart *qi* (*xin qi zuoyong de rongqi* 心氣作用的容器), and through the body, heartmind, intentions and *qi* affect each other reciprocally. Blood and *qi* (*xue qi*) guide the *qi* of virtuous intentions (*dao de zhi qi* 道德志氣), and complete the process of self-cultivation” (Pham 2013: 62).

Once we see body and mind as a continuum of *qi*, other passages admit of new interpretations. An example is XZMC 43–44 (discussed above), which compares the effects of relying on the heartmind, knowledge, *qing*, and the body. It concludes that the senses’ love of colour and sound create a “*qi* of unassuaged joy or anxiety” (*yu tao zhi qi* 鬱陶之氣) that can be fatal. The passage continues:

有其為人之節節如也，不有夫蹇蹇之心則采。有其為人之蹇蹇如也，不有夫恆怡之志則縵[慢]。²⁰

For those who conduct themselves steadily (*jie jie*, “step by step”), if they do not have a straightforward (*jian jian*) heartmind, they become ostentatious [over-adorned]. For those who conduct themselves in a straightforward manner, if they do not have intentions of permanent joy, they become indolent. (366–67/XZMC 44–45)

Pham links the “*qi* of unassuaged joy or anxiety” (*yutao zhi qi*) to the account of body, mind and *qi* in the XZMC (Pham 2013: 74). This *qi* of joy or anxiety is present in the sensory organs, in the eyes’ love of colour or the ears’ love of sound. The heartmind moves and initiates the faculties of creatures composed of blood and *qi*,

²⁰There are several readings for the binome *jian jian*, including 蹇蹇, 東東 and 蹇蹇 (Li 2002: 110; Cook 2012: 2: 732–34; Pham 2013: 67). Another textual problem concerns 采, which Pham reads as *nie* 餓, “dispirited.” A third is 慢, which I follow Guo Yi in reading as 縵 (Guo 2001). Pham reads *ji zhi zhi zhi ze man* 亟治之志則慢 as “if they do not have intentions of urgent government, they become indolent.”

but if there is an excess of *yutao zhi qi* pent up within the body, it cannot flow and circulate smoothly. As a result, people can easily die of it (365–66/XZMC 43–44, quoted above).

Similarly, an undisciplined (*fang zong* 放縱) heartmind, wisdom, *qing*, body and force lead to excess in reflection (*si*), anxiety (*huan* 患), grief and joy (*ai le* 哀樂), etc., and this accumulation results in agitation (*zao* 躁), illness (*ji* 疾) and other problems (364–66/XZMC 42–44, quoted above). These five so-called mental, emotional and physical forces, Pham argues, can be reduced to two: the heartmind and the body. It is the activity of the heartmind and body together that produce restlessness, illness, extreme anxiety and other extreme reactions which in turn stimulate excesses of blood and *qi* (in the medical senses of these terms) that lead to extreme physical reactions. It is in this sense that the eyes' love of colour and the ears' love of sound cause *yutao zhi qi*. Pham's point is that all these conditions are caused by (over) abundant *qi* (*qi sheng* 氣盛). Left alone in that state, it can be fatal. She concludes "body, heart and *qi* are equal to each other" (Pham 2013: 74).

The interest of this argument for the present discussion is its relatively holist account of body and heartmind. It is also noteworthy that this argument does not focus on any special trustworthiness of sound, but rather on the embodied nature of all sensation and the close interactions between body and mind.

6 Conclusions

In the above analysis I have attempted to read the Guodian corpus as a more or less unified text (rather than a collection of separate "Confucian" and "Daoist" writings) with a coherent account of problems of self-cultivation.²¹ Indeed, as Middendorf points out, although none of its ideas are new or unique, the XZMC in particular presents a compact "review" of key Warring States positions on human nature and basic emotions (*xing* and *qing*), self-cultivation and virtue, and all these topics inherently involve the relation between body and mind (Middendorf 2008: 145).

Therefore it is perhaps surprising to see that the Guodian corpus does not present a unified position on the relation between *shenti* and *xin*, but rather presents a range of views on relations between them. Positions range from a strong dualism in some passages in the WX and ZY to a strong holism, on some readings of the XZMC. Other passages in the XZMC seem to present an intermediate position (which could be described as either weak mind-body dualism or weak mind-body holism).

Two passages in WX and ZY compare the heartmind to the ruler of a state and the body to his subordinates. In the ZY passage the subordinates are the people. In the more striking WX passage, the subordinates are slaves. This latter passage is especially striking—and indeed anomalous—in the light of a range of Warring

²¹ On this point see, for example, Csikszentmihalyi (2004) and Slingerland (2008).

States heartmind–ruler comparisons that take the body as the ruler’s ministers or officials.²²

At the other end of the spectrum is a robustly holist view of *qi* unifying—and equalizing—body and mind. Here, similarities between the “flow” of *qi*, sound, and music are the conduits that makes possible moral transformation through music. A more conventional reading of the XZMC is also more dualist, by virtue of privileging the ability of the heartmind to create fixed intentions as part of the process of self-cultivation.

In conclusion, this range of positions shows the volatility of the question of the interrelations between body and mind, and their importance in the virtue-based strategies that are central to Guodian accounts of both self-cultivation and state organization.

References

- Andreini, Attilio. 2006. “The Meaning of *Qing* 情 in the Texts of Guodian Tomb no. 1.” In Paolo Santangelo and Donatello Guida, eds., *Love, Hatred, and Other Passions: Questions and Themes on Emotions in Chinese Civilization*, 149–65. Leiden: Brill.
- Chan, Shirley [Chen Hui 陳慧]. 2009a. “Human Nature and Moral Cultivation in the Guodian 郭店 Text of the *Xing zi ming chu* 性自命出 (Nature Derives from Mandate).” *Dao* 8: 361–82.
- Chan, Shirley [Chen Hui 陳慧]. 2009b. “The Ruler/Ruled Relationship in the ‘Black Robes’ Contained in the Newly Excavated Guodian Bamboo Texts.” *Journal of Asian History* 1.43: 19–30.
- Chan, Shirley [Chen Hui 陳慧]. 2011. “Cosmology, Society and Humanity: *Tian* in the Guodian texts (Part I).” *Journal of Chinese Philosophy, Supplement to Vol. 38. Supplement Issue: Confucian Philosophy: Transformations and Innovations*: 64–77.
- Chan, Shirley [Chen Hui 陳慧]. 2012. “Cosmology, Society, and Humanity: *Tian* in the Guodian Texts (Part II).” *Journal of Chinese Philosophy* 39.1: 106–20.
- Chen, Wei 陳偉. 2002. *Alternative Interpretations of Guodian Bamboo Texts* 郭店竹書別釋. Wuhan: Hubei Jiaoyu Chubanshe.
- Cook, Scott. 2012. *The Bamboo Texts of Guodian: A Study and Complete Translation*, 2 vols. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Csikszentmihalyi, Mark. 2004. *Material Virtue: Ethics and the Body in Early China*. Leiden: Brill.
- Ding, Sixin 丁四新. 2000. *Research on the Thought of the Guodian Chu Bamboo Slips* 郭店楚墓竹簡思想研究. Beijing: Dongfang Chubanshe.
- Ding, Yuanzhi 丁原植. 2000. *Analyses of the Four Lost Confucian Texts from the Guodian Chu slips* 郭店楚簡儒家佚籍四種釋析. Taipei: Taiwan Guji Chubanshe.
- Guo, Qiyong 郭齊勇. 2000. “Analysis of the View of Body and Mind in the Guodian Chu Slips 郭店楚簡身心觀發微.” In Wuhan University Research Institute for Chinese Culture 武漢大學中國研究院, ed., *Proceedings of the International Symposium on the Guodian Chu Bamboo Slips* 郭店楚簡國際學術會議研討會論文集, 198–209. Wuhan: Hubei Renmin Chubanshe.
- Guo, Yi 郭沂. 2001. *The Guodian Bamboo Slips and Pre-Qin Learning and Thought* 郭店竹簡與先秦學術思想. Shanghai: Shanghai Jiaoyu Chubanshe.
- Guodian Chumu zhujian. 1998. 郭店楚墓竹簡[Bamboo slips from the Chu tombs at Guodian]. Beijing: Wenwu.

²²For fuller discussion see Raphals (2015).

- Huang, Dekuan 黃德寬 and Xu Zaiguó 徐在國. 1999. "Guodian chujian wenzi xukao 郭店楚簡文字續考." *Jiangan Archeology* 江漢考古 2: 75–77.
- Huangdi neijing suwen. 1963. 黃帝內經素問[The Inner Classic of the Yellow Lord: Basic Questions]. Beijing: Renmin.
- Ji, Xusheng 季旭昇. 2004. "Discussion of *Qing* and *Xing* 性情論." In *Warring States Chu Bamboo Texts Collected by the Shanghai Museum*, vol. 1 上海博物館藏戰國楚竹簡, 152–221. Taipei: Wanjuanlou Tushu Fufen.
- Jiang, Guanghui. 2000. "The Guodian Chu Slips and Early Confucianism." *Contemporary Chinese Thought* 32.2: 6–38.
- Jingmenshi Bowuguan 荊門市博物館, ed., 1998. *Bamboo Slips from the Chu Tombs at Guodian 郭店楚簡*. Beijing: Wenwu Chubanshe.
- Li, Ling 李零. 2002. *Reading Notes on the Guodian Chu Slips* 郭店楚簡校讀記. Beijing: Beijing Daxue Chubanshe.
- Li, Tianhong 李天虹. 2003. *Research on the Xingzi mingchu* 《性自命出》研究. Wuhan: Hubei Jiaoyu Chubanshe.
- Liao, Mingchun 廖名春. 2001. *On the New Chu Bamboo Slips* 新出楚簡試論, 133–70. Shanghai: Yuwan.
- Liu, Xinlan 劉昕嵐. 2000. "Explanation of *Xingzi mingchu* in the Guodian Chu Slips 郭店楚簡《性自命出》篇箋釋." In Wuhan University Research Institute for Chinese Culture 武漢大學中國研究院, ed., *Proceedings of the International Symposium on the Guodian Chu Bamboo Slips* 郭店楚簡國際學術會議研討會論文集, 330–54. Wuhan: Hubei Renmin Chubanshe.
- Liu, Zhao 劉釗. 2000. "Notes on Words in the Guodian Chu Slips 讀郭店楚簡字詞札記." In Wuhan University Research Institute for Chinese Culture 武漢大學中國研究院 ed., *Proceedings of the International Symposium on the Guodian Chu Bamboo Slips* 郭店楚簡國際學術會議研討會論文, 75–93. Wuhan: Hubei Renmin Chubanshe.
- Liu, Zhao 劉釗. 2003. *An Interpretation with Corrections of the Guodian Chu Slips* 郭店楚簡校釋. Fuzhou: Fujian Renmin Chubanshe.
- Lo, Y.K. 2003. "Finding the Self in the *Analects*: A Philological Approach." In K.C. Chong, S.H. Tan and C.L. Ten, eds., *The Moral Circle and the Self: Chinese and Western Approaches*, 249–68. LaSalle: Open Court.
- Ma, Chengyuan 馬承源, ed. 2001. *The Warring States Chu Bamboo Texts Collected by the Shanghai Museum*, vol. 1 上海博物館藏戰國楚竹書. Shanghai: Shanghai Guji Chubanshe.
- Mawangdui Hanmu boshu zhengli xiaozu 馬王堆漢墓帛書整理小組, ed. 1980. *The Mawangdui Han Tomb Silk Texts* 馬王堆漢墓帛書. Beijing: Wenwu Chubanshe.
- Middendorf, Ulrike. 2008. "Again on *Qing*. With a Translation of the Guodian 'Xing zi ming chu'." *Oriens Extremus* 47: 97–159.
- Pang, Pu 龐樸. 2000. "From Confucius to Mencius: The Confucian Theory of Mind and Nature in the Guodian Chu Slips." *Contemporary Chinese Thought* 32.2: 39–54. Reprint of translation of "Kong Meng zhi jian—Guodian Chu jian zhong de rujia xinxingshuo 孔孟之間-郭店楚簡中的儒家心性說." *Chinese Philosophy* 中國哲學 20: 22–35.
- Perkins, Franklin. 2009. "Motivation and the Heart in the *Xing Zi Ming Chu*." *Dao* 8: 117–31.
- Pham, Lee-Moi 范麗梅. 2013. "Body, Mind, *Qi* and Self-Cultivation in the Guodian *Xingzi Mingchu* 節節蹇蹇、永思喟如——郭店《性自命出》亟治德的身心氣書寫." *Qinghua xuebao* 清華學報 43.1: 53–96.
- Puett, Michael. 2004. "The Notion of *Qing* in Early Chinese Thought." In Halvor Eifring, ed., *Love and Emotion in Traditional Chinese Literature*, 37–68. Leiden: Brill.
- Qiu, Xigui 裘錫圭. 1998. "Qiu's Suggestions: Appended Notes after Each Text 裘接." In Jingmenshi Bowuguan 荊門市博物館, ed., *Guodian Chumu zhujian* 郭店楚簡竹簡. Beijing: Wenwu Chubanshe.
- Raphals, Lisa. 2015. "Mind and Body in Early China and Greece." *Journal of Cognitive Historiography* 2.2: 132–82.

- Raphals, Lisa. 2018. "Human and Animal in Early China and Greece." In G.E.R. Lloyd and Jingyi Jenny Zhao, with Qiaosheng Dong, eds., *Ancient Greece and China Compared*, 131–59. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Slingerland, Edward T. 2008. "The Problem of Moral Spontaneity in the Guodian Corpus." *Dao* 7.3: 237–56.
- Sterckx, Roel. 2007. "Searching for Spirit: Shen and Sacrifice in Warring States and Han Philosophy and Ritual." *Extrême-Orient, Extrême-Occident* 29: 23–54.
- Unschuld, Paul and H. Tessenow. 2011. *Huang Di nei jing su wen: An Annotated Translation of Huang Di's Inner Classic—Basic Questions*. 2 vols. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Wierzbicka, Anna. 1989. "Soul and Mind: Linguistic Evidence for Ethnopsychology and Cultural History." *American Anthropologist* n.s. 1: 41–58.
- Wong, Wan-chi 黃蘊智. 2014. "A Genealogy of Self in Chinese Culture." *Monumenta Serica* 62.1: 1–54.
- Yu, Ning. 2007. "Heart and Cognition in Ancient Chinese Philosophy." *Journal of Cognition and Culture* 7: 27–47.
- Yuan, Guohua [Yuen Kwok Wa] 袁國華. 2000. "A Study of the Character *du* in the Guodian Chu Tomb Bamboo Slip Text *Wu xing* 郭店楚墓竹簡《五行》「讎度」字考釋." *Zhongguo wenzi* 中國文字 n.s. 26.12: 169–76.
- Zhang, Jing 張靜. 2004. "Explanations and Corrections of Graphs for Three Words in the Guodian Chu Bamboo Slips 郭店楚簡文字釋遺三則." *Journal of Chinese Paleography* 古文字研究 25.10: 361–63.
- Zhao, Jianwei 趙建偉. 1999. "Interpretation with Corrections of the Guodian Bamboo Slip texts *Zhongxin zhi Dao* and *Xingzi Mingchu* 郭店竹簡《忠信之道》、《性自命出》校釋." *History of Chinese Philosophy* 中國哲學史 26: 34–39.